



### **3.0 CONSULTATIONS**

#### 3.1 Internal

3.1.1 City Development - As the land is currently allocated as a standard employment site, the proposal would be a loss of employment on the site. Therefore Policy E3b is relevant. As part of this the applicant must show that in both qualitative and quantitative terms the site is no longer contributing to the stock i.e. no longer suitable for employment use. If Policy E3b is satisfied then Policy H17 is relevant. The residential care home is located close to B1, B2, and B8 use and would therefore not sit well with its surrounding uses.

3.1.2 Countryside Officer - There is little of significance on the site. There should be some enhancement to the hedge along the boundary with Bootham Stray for both visual and biodiversity reasons. A water vole population has recently been found in nearby ditches. Also great crested newts are recorded from across the Stray close to Wigginton Road. It is not considered that either of these need to be particularly addressed in this application as the land is not suitable habitat, however, should the work affect or require alteration to drainage on the adjacent land, then there could be significant issues that need to be addressed. A three storey building in this location could accommodate biodiversity enhancement and this could be conditioned.

3.1.3 Environmental Protection Unit - No objections, however the site is in close proximity to residential properties and light warehousing etc. Therefore concerns are raised regarding noise from the industrial area affecting the amenity of residents of the care home. There are also concerns that noise from the care home may affect the amenity of the nearby residential properties.

#### 3.2 External

3.2.1 Clifton Without Parish Council - Deferment of this application is strongly recommended until such time as a site entrance and parking is detailed. It is considered that in the interests of safety this should be a key matter for ambulances, fire and rescue services and the general safe availability of parking facilities.

3.2.2 Clifton Moor Business Association - No objections.

3.2.3 Yorkshire Water - Four conditions suggested to be included with any approval.

3.2.4 Public Consultation - One letter of objection received from adjacent office unit. The following points were raised:

- The car parking spaces allocated to a care home with 60 bedrooms and a staffing level of above 20 is wholly inadequate. Families who visit will struggle to park resulting in people using unsafe parking positions.
- The plot of land would be overdeveloped with there being little space around such an enormous building. This would not be acceptable when viewed from the

residential dwellings or the office units nearby. It is also not a good environment to have a care home surrounded by office and industrial developments.

- The proposed building is too high and would make the premises imposing.

## **4.0 APPRAISAL**

### **4.1 Key Issues:**

- Principle of Development
- Access
- Living Conditions of the Care Home
- Impact on Local Residents

### **4.2 Relevant Local Plan Policies**

The Local Plan identifies Centurion Park as a Standard Employment Allocation. Policy E3b seeks to protect employment sites and states that planning permission for other uses will only be given where:

- a) there is a sufficient supply of employment land to meet both immediate and longer term requirements over the plan period in both quantitative and qualitative terms; and
- b) unacceptable environmental problems exist; or
- c) the development of the site for other appropriate uses will lead to significant benefits to the local economy; or
- d) the use is ancillary to an employment use.

4.3 Local Plan Policy H17 states that planning permission will only be granted for residential institutions where the development, together with existing residential institutions or unimplemented planning permission for that use, would not give rise to a concentration likely to have an adverse impact on residential amenity and where it is positively located relative to local facilities and public transport.

4.4 Principle of Development - The first consideration within this application is regarding the principle of a development of this type in this location. The proposed care home is not an employment use and therefore is a change of use of the site from its standard employment allocation. Part a) and one of parts b), c) and d) of Policy E3b would need to be satisfied in order to justify the loss of this employment site. Detailed information has not been submitted with this application which shows that there is a sufficient supply of employment land in the immediate and long term. A previous application on this site, reference number 07/00248/OUTM, was partly refused based on it not being proven that there is a sufficient supply of employment land in quantitative and qualitative terms. The constraints placed on the availability of greenfield development sites around York by the existing Green Belt adds particular importance to ensuring that land designated for employment uses is safeguarded for such uses. A further consideration is what impact the care home would have on the future development of the site. Centurion Park is allocated for B1, B2, and B8 use which have the potential to conflict with a residential care home. The construction of a care home in this location limits the future development potential of the site in addition to resulting in the loss of part of the site to a non-employment use.

4.5 This application varies from the previous application in relation to Policy E3b in that it is considered to satisfy part c) of this policy. It is estimated by the applicant

that over 60 jobs could be created on site which would bring significant benefits to the local economy. The figure of 60 new jobs is based on an estimate of the number of rooms and on the size of the site. This figure seems reasonable. A care home was approved on 0.3 hectares of land off Manor Lane in Rawcliffe in 2004, reference number 04/00479/FULM, which was expected to create around 68 full time equivalent jobs. However, overall it is officer opinion that the proposal does not comply with Policy E3b due to part a).

4.6 Access - Vehicular access to the site is considered to be acceptable in terms of its impact on the local highway network. The area is designated for employment purposes and such there is likely to be significant transport movements from any use on this site. The access road is already in place and capable of serving the number of vehicle movements expected from a care home on a site of this scale. However, access for pedestrians, is considered to be poor. In order for residents to enter and leave the site they must pass through a business park before reaching a bus stop or any local services. It is considered that the business park would act as both a perceived and actual barrier for residents, particularly the infirm or physically disabled who are likely occupiers of the premises.

4.7 Living Conditions of the Care Home - A consideration in approving a care home in outline for this site is the likely living conditions of residents. The proposal is clearly part of an industrial/business estate and not the residential estate to the south. The care home would have a warehouse to the west and an office development to the north. It is considered that if constructed using suitable materials and in accordance with noise conditions recommended by the Environmental Protection Unit that there would not be significant harm in terms of noise or general disruption. However, the care home would be isolated from both the local residential area and from local services or facilities. There is little indication of the level of care required at the care home and therefore it cannot be concluded whether the population of the care home would be able to leave the site unaccompanied. Having regard to the foregoing it is considered that the location of the care home would not provide an acceptable local environment for the residents and is therefore contrary to H17 of the Local Plan.

4.8 Impact on Local Residents - The dwellings towards the end of Thorntree Grove and Hornbeam Close immediately border the site. The site is allocated for B1, B2, or B8 use and thus there is an expectation that a significant development will operate from this site at some stage. In terms of the impact on these dwellings it is considered that a care home could be designed to not appear harmful to the living conditions of these residents and would indeed provide a buffer between their properties and the business/office park. However, it is also considered that a light industry or office development could be located here without causing significant harm to local residents. No letters of objection were received from local residents.

4.9 On balance, notwithstanding the creation of an estimated 60 new jobs and the potential for a scheme to be developed which does not harm the living conditions of neighbouring dwellings, it is considered that the proposal is not acceptable. In summary the application has failed to satisfy part a) of Policy E3b and provides a poor quality local environment for future residents of the care home located within an established business park.

## 5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 It is considered that the proposal fails to satisfy Policies E3b and H17 of the City of York Draft Local Plan.

## 6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

1 The application site lies within an area which is designated as a standard employment site. It is considered that it has not been proven that there is a sufficient supply of employment land to meet immediate and longer term requirements or that this site is no longer required in quantitative and qualitative terms for employment purposes. The proposed development, by virtue of its sensitivity to noise is considered to constitute a poor neighbour to a business park, and one that is likely to result in restrictions on the use of the neighbouring business premises. Therefore the proposal is considered contrary to Policy E3b of the City of York Draft Local Plan.

2 It is considered that the location of the proposed care home, namely within an established business park, would provide a poor quality living environment and an unsatisfactory outlook of a business/industrial nature for residents of the care home. Access to and from the residential unit is through a business park consisting of B1 and B8 uses which would act as a perceived barrier for residents to access local services and facilities. The proposal is therefore considered contrary to Policies GP1 and H17 of the City of York Draft Local Plan and Central Government advice contained within Planning Policy Statement 1 "Delivering Sustainable Development".

## 7.0 INFORMATIVES:

### Contact details:

**Author:** Michael Jones Development Control Officer  
**Tel No:** 01904 551325